Speakers

Jake Spiegel, Research Associate, Health and Wealth, Employee Benefit Research Institute

Eric Wilson, Analyst, Office of Research and Program Manager, Consumer Financial Protection Bureau

Paul Fronstin, Director of Health Benefits Research, Employee Benefit Research Institute

Moderator: Tami Simon, Senior Vice President, Global Corporate Consulting Business Leader, Segal
John Doe

Click this button

Type question(s) here

To: All panelists
Your text can only be seen by panelists
Trends in Out-of-Pocket Spending

Jake Spiegel
Employee Benefit Research Institute
Setting the Stage

• Premiums for employer-sponsored health insurance have significantly outpaced inflation for two decades.

• Meanwhile, data collected by the Center for Medicare and Medicaid Studies found that out-of-pocket spending is at its lowest point ever recorded.

• What gives?
Are Out-of-Pocket Costs Increasing?

- EBRI used MarketScan data to evaluate the extent to which out-of-pocket costs are increasing for people covered by employer-sponsored insurance (ESI).
- We examined claims data ranging from 2013 to 2020, accounting for over 45 million patients and nearly $1 trillion in spending.
- We examined trends in spending on inpatient services, outpatient services, and prescription drug claims.
Are Out-of-Pocket Costs Increasing?

- In the aggregate, we find that patients paid a higher share of their medical expenditures out of pocket in 2019 compared to 2013.

- A quick aside: the pandemic significantly impacted the use of health care services.
Are Out-of-Pocket Costs Increasing?

- When we break down out-of-pocket spending trends by quartile, we find that particularly high spenders saw their share of out-of-pocket spending rise faster than those in lower spending quartiles.
Are Out-of-Pocket Costs Increasing?
Are Out-of-Pocket Costs Increasing?

• When we break down out-of-pocket costs by plan type, however, a different story emerges

• The average share of medical expenditures paid out of pocket by people covered by HDHPs and CDHPs *decreased* between 2013 and 2019

• For people covered by PPO/POS plans, the share remained stable

• Finally, people covered by HMO/EPO plans paid a slightly higher share out-of-pocket in 2019 compared to 2013
How Could *That* Be?

- For most plan types, the share of expenditures paid out of pocket remained stable or decreased between 2013 and 2019, and yet in aggregate, out-of-pocket expenditures are increasing.

- There has been a shift in health plan enrollment trends:
  - HDHPs and CDHPs are becoming increasingly popular.
  - These plans often necessitate patients paying a greater share of their medical expenditures out of pocket.
To Recap

• Spending increased faster for particularly high spenders
• Spending increased faster for outpatient services relative to inpatient services and prescription drugs
• The share of health care spending paid by patients increased between 2013 and 2019
  • But it’s complicated
• The aggregate trend we observe appears attributable to a shift in health plan enrollment trends
A Demographic Analysis of Unpaid Medical Bills

Paul Fronstin, Ph.D.
Employee Benefit Research Institute
Medical Debt vs. Other Debt

- Medical debt is different from other forms of debt.
- Some forms of debt, such as a mortgage, automobile loan, or student loan, are taken on voluntarily.
- Consumers can shop for the best interest rate and have time to consider the cost of the home, automobile, or tuition.
- When it comes to medical debt, consumers of health care usually do not plan to take it on, as it is often the result of a one-time or short-term medical expense arising from an acute medical need.
- Because of the way health care expenses are often incurred, most people are not in a position to shop for health care services like they can for a home, automobile, or education.
Impact of Medical Debt

• Medical debt levels are often low, especially relative to other forms of debt, but there is still the potential for adverse effects.

• Medical debt on credit reports can affect one’s ability to obtain a mortgage, get a lease for an apartment, get insurance, get a job, and obtain other forms of credit.

• Medical debt may affect credit worthiness, which affects the interest rate that a consumer can get on a loan.

• Medical debt may lead to delay or avoidance of health care, which can result in not just higher health care costs in the long term, but also worse health outcomes.
Changes to Reporting of Medical Debt on Credit Reports

The three major credit bureaus are overhauling how medical debt is reflected on credit reports:

• Beginning in July 2022, Equifax, TransUnion, and Experian stopped including medical debts that were previously in collections.

• Medical debts will not be reflected on credit reports until they have been past due for one year.

• In 2023, medical debts below $500 will no longer be reported on credit reports.

A contributing factor to this change was research that found past-due medical bills to be an unreliable indicator of a person’s ability to pay other debts.
National Financial Capability Study (NFCS)

The National Financial Capability Study (NFCS) has been conducted every three years since 2009 by the FINRA Investor Education Foundation to benchmark key indicators of financial capability and to evaluate how these indicators vary with demographic, behavioral, attitudinal, and financial literacy characteristics.

- More than 27,100 U.S. adults ages 18 and older were surveyed for the 2021 study.
- The data are weighted to be representative of the national population in terms of age, gender, ethnicity, education, and census division.
- State-level estimates can also be derived using weights that accompany the NFCS data, and when weighted, state figures are representative of each state in terms of age, gender, ethnicity and education.
- Fielding was conducted from June to October 2021.
- Most of the analyses focused on people ages 18-64.
Past-Due Medical Bills, Individuals Ages 18 and Older, 2012-2021

## Prevalence of Various Types of Debt for American Adults, 2021

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Debt</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Carried a Credit Card Balance in the Past Year</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Used Non-Bank Borrowing in the Past Five Years</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have a Mortgage or Home Equity Loan</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have an Auto Loan</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have a Student Loan</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have Unpaid Medical Bills That Are Past Due</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Americans Ages 18 and Older, by Past-Due Medical Bills, 2021

Past-Due Medical Bills, Individuals Ages 18–64, by Gender and Age, 2021

Past-Due Medical Bills, Individuals Ages 18–64, by U.S. Armed Services Status, 2021

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Currently a Member of the U.S. Armed Services</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Previously a Member of the U.S. Armed Services</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never a Member of the U.S. Armed Services</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prefer Not to Say</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Past-Due Medical Bills, Individuals Ages 18–64, by Health Insurance Status, 2021

Other Findings

- Less educated and lower income more likely to have past-due medical bills.
- Past-due medical bills has expected impact on use of health care services (skipped office visits and did not fill a prescription).
- Credit record more likely to be very bad or bad when there are past-due medical bills.
- Those with past-due medical bills are less likely to have an emergency fund and less likely to be able to come up with $2,000.

Medical expenses and financial outcomes
November 2022
What I’ll talk about

1. Disclaimer
2. CFPB and Office of Research Background
3. Medical bills/expenses/income loss
4. Financial assistance
5. Medical collections
6. Limitations
7. Implications
Disclaimer

This presentation is being made by a Consumer Financial Protection Bureau representative on behalf of the Bureau. It does not constitute legal interpretation, guidance, or advice of the Consumer Financial Protection Bureau. Any opinions or views stated by the presenter are the presenter’s own and may not represent the Bureau’s views.
CFPB’s mission

The Consumer Financial Protection Bureau (CFPB) is a 21st century agency that helps consumer finance markets work by making rules more effective, by consistently and fairly enforcing those rules, and by empowering consumers to take more control over their economic lives.
The Office of Research

The Director shall establish a unit whose functions shall include researching, analyzing, and reporting on—

(A) developments in markets for consumer financial products or services, including market areas of alternative consumer financial products or services with high growth rates and areas of risk to consumers;

(B) access to fair and affordable credit for traditionally underserved communities

(C) consumer awareness, understanding, and use of disclosures and communications

(D) consumer awareness and understanding of costs, risks, and benefits of consumer financial products or services;

(E) consumer behavior with respect to consumer financial products or services, including performance on mortgage loans; and

(F) experiences of traditionally underserved consumers, including un-banked and under-banked consumers.
Data

- **The Consumer Credit Panel (CCP)**
  - More than five million de-identified credit records from one of the three nationwide consumer reporting agencies.
  - Updated monthly to observe how an individual’s credit use changes over time

- **The Making Ends Meet Survey**
  - Recently launched series of surveys to consumers based on the CCP
  - Covers general financial topics
  - Upcoming survey module on medical debt
Medical expenses: The most common cause of financial difficulty

Percent reporting difficulty due to...

- Medical expenses or fees: 12.3% (Jun-19) vs. 8.3% (Jun-20)
- Less work available because of coronavirus: 7.1% (Jun-19) vs. N/A (Jun-20)
- Auto repair: 8.4% (Jun-19) vs. 6.9% (Jun-20)
- Workplace closed because of coronavirus: 5.7% (Jun-19) vs. N/A (Jun-20)
- Helping family: 6.4% (Jun-19) vs. 4.8% (Jun-20)
- Taxes or fees: 5.0% (Jun-19) vs. 3.6% (Jun-20)
- Home repair: 5.6% (Jun-19) vs. 3.3% (Jun-20)
- Other loss of income: 3.8% (Jun-19) vs. 2.9% (Jun-20)
- Student loan or education costs: 4.3% (Jun-19) vs. 2.3% (Jun-20)
- Loss of income from illness: 4.0% (Jun-19) vs. 2.3% (Jun-20)
- Loss of job: 6.1% (Jun-19) vs. 2.1% (Jun-20)
Illness and injury among the main reasons for income loss

Percent who experienced a significant income drop in the past year from...

- Any significant income drop: 45%
- Reduction in work hours: 29%
- Period of unemployment or furlough: 26%
- Worked less because of illness or injury: 12%
- Other significant drop in income: 11%
- Worked less or stopped working to take care of children: 9.1%
- Changed to a lower-paying job: 9%
- Worked less to care for others who were sick or injured: 7.4%
- Loss of government benefits: 7.2%
- Could not work because someone in your household was in jail: 0.48%

February 2021 vs June 2019

- Any significant income drop:
  - February 2021: 45%
  - June 2019: 33%
- Reduction in work hours:
  - February 2021: 29%
  - June 2019: 19%
- Period of unemployment or furlough:
  - February 2021: 26%
  - June 2019: 17%
- Worked less because of illness or injury:
  - February 2021: 12%
  - June 2019: 11%
- Other significant drop in income:
  - February 2021: 11%
  - June 2019: 8.6%
- Worked less or stopped working to take care of children:
  - February 2021: 9.1%
  - June 2019: 9.4%
- Changed to a lower-paying job:
  - February 2021: 9%
  - June 2019: 4.4%
- Worked less to care for others who were sick or injured:
  - February 2021: 7.4%
  - June 2019: 5.5%
- Loss of government benefits:
  - February 2021: 7.2%
  - June 2019: 1.7%
- Could not work because someone in your household was in jail:
  - February 2021: 0.48%
  - June 2019: 1.7%
Medical bills most frequently deferred/delayed/skipped between March 2020 and February 2021

Percent who delayed, deferred, or skipped each type of bill:
- Medical bills: 13%
- Utility: 11%
- Credit card: 11%
- Cell phone: 8.5%
- Cable or internet: 6.9%
- Rent: 5.7%
- Mortgage: 4.8%
Medical collections most common type of collections tradeline

Distribution of collections tradelines by type as of Q2 2018

- Medical/Health Care: 58%
- Telecommunications: 15%
- Retail: 6%
- Banking: 5%
- Other: 5%
- Financial: 5%
- Utilities: 5%
- Unknown: 1%

Consumer Financial Protection Bureau
Collectors most frequently contact consumers about medical debt

Percentage of people contacted by a collector for each type of debt/past-due bill

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Past-due bills</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Medical bill</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telecom. bill</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utility bill</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxes</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal judgment or expenses</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rent</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Debts</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Credit or charge card</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student loan</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auto-purchase loan</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mortgage or HELOC</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Payday loan</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

cfpb Consumer Financial Protection Bureau
Limitations

- Survey sample sizes can be small
- Self-reported information can be inaccurate
- Survey samples from CCP, so misses people without a credit record
- CCP only shows us credit information that is furnished
Hazards to consumers (non-exhaustive)

- “Financial”
  - Simultaneous income/expense shocks
  - Spillover effects
  - Reduced credit access
- “Non-financial”
  - First-order health impacts
  - Stress
  - Reluctance to seek medical treatment
Zooming out

- Medicaid expansion and medical collections
- Hospitals’ financial assistance programs
- Changes to consumer reporting policies from Experian, Equifax, and Transunion
  - Extend the waiting period before furnishing medical debt from 180 days to one year (effective July 2022).
  - Remove medical debts paid by consumers (effective July 2022).
  - Stop reporting medical debts under $500 (effective 2023)
Questions?
Supplemental data
Skipping medical bills coincides with other financial difficulty
Over-penalization of medical collections in older scoring models
State-level distribution of medical collections, December 2020
Medical collections by income and household composition

- $40,000 or less, Households with children: 38.1%
- $40,000 or less, Households without children: 13.4%
- $40,000+, Households with children: 10.6%
- $40,000+, Households without children: 6.3%

Consumer Financial Protection Bureau
Share of consumers with collections likely to be removed

Source: CCP.
Upcoming Events

**November 22** — 2022 Spending in Retirement Survey: Understanding the Pandemic’s Impact webinar

**November 30** — EBRI Board of Trustees Meeting

**November 30** — EBRI Research Committee Meeting

**December 1** — EBRI Retirement Summit