Trends in Self-Insured Health Plans Since the ACA

By Paul Fronstin, Ph.D., Employee Benefit Research Institute

AT A GLANCE

How has the Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act of 2010 (ACA) affected trends in the availability of and enrollment in self-insured health plans among private-sector establishments offering health plans and their covered workers? Using data from the Medical Expenditure Panel Survey - Insurance Component (MEPS-IC), this paper examines recent trends with a particular focus on 2013 to 2020.

Key findings:

- The percentage of all private-sector establishments offering health plans increased through 2016 but has ebbed and flowed since.
- Between 2013 and 2016, the percentages of small and medium-sized establishments offering at least one self-insured plan both increased. They have also bounced up and down since.
- Between 2013 and 2017, the self-insurance trend for large establishments declined. A rebound started in 2018, but the rebound did not hold in 2020.
- Overall, the percentage of workers in self-insured plans has been bouncing around between 58 percent and 60 percent since 2013.
- Self-insurance varied substantially by state. Overall, the percentage of private-sector enrollees in self-insured plans ranged from 34.8 percent in Hawaii to 72.7 percent in North Carolina.
Paul Fronstin is Director of the Health Research and Education Program at the Employee Benefit Research Institute (EBRI). This Issue Brief was written with assistance from the Institute’s research and editorial staffs. Any views expressed in this report are those of the authors, and should not be ascribed to the officers, trustees, or other sponsors of EBRI, EBRI-ERF, or their staffs. Neither EBRI nor EBRI-ERF lobbies or takes positions on specific policy proposals. EBRI invites comment on this research.


Copyright Information: This report is copyrighted by the Employee Benefit Research Institute (EBRI). You may copy, print, or download this report solely for personal and noncommercial use, provided that all hard copies retain any and all copyright and other applicable notices contained therein, and you may cite or quote small portions of the report provided that you do so verbatim and with proper citation. Any use beyond the scope of the foregoing requires EBRI’s prior express permission. For permissions, please contact EBRI at permissions@ebri.org.

Report availability: This report is available on the internet at www.ebri.org

Table of Contents
Introduction ........................................................................................................................................... 3
Establishments With Self-Insured Plans ............................................................................................... 3
Workers Enrolled in Self-Insured Plans ............................................................................................... 5
Conclusion ........................................................................................................................................... 7
Endnotes .............................................................................................................................................. 8

Figures
Figure 1, Percentage of Private-Sector Establishments Offering Health Plans That Self-Insure at Least One Plan, 1996–2020 ................................................................................................................................. 4
Figure 2, Percentage of Private-Sector Establishments Offering Health Plans That Self-Insure at Least One Plan, by Firm Size, 2013–2020 .................................................................................................................. 5
Figure 3, Percentage of Covered Private-Sector Workers Enrolled in Self-Insured Health Plans, 1996–2020 .......... 6
Figure 4, Percentage of Covered Private-Sector Workers Enrolled in Self-Insured Health Plans, by Firm Size, 2013–2020 ........................................................................................................................................... 6
Figure 5, Percentage of Private-Sector Enrollees in Self-Insured Plans, by State, 2020 ................................. 7
Trends in Self-Insured Health Plans Since the ACA

By Paul Fronstin, Ph.D., Employee Benefit Research Institute

Introduction
Since the passage of the Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act of 2010 (ACA), some commentators have speculated that an increasing number of small and medium-sized employers would convert their health plans from fully insured to self-insured plans. The rationale has been that several of the key ACA components — creditable coverage, affordability, essential benefits, and various taxes and fees — would drive up the cost of health coverage, thus possibly making self-insurance — which is viewed by many as generally less expensive than fully insured alternatives — a more attractive option for many employers.

This paper examines trends in the availability of and enrollment in self-insured health plans among private-sector establishments offering health plans and their covered workers, with a particular focus on 2013 to 2020, so as to assess whether the ACA might have affected these trends and more recent trends. The data come from the Medical Expenditure Panel Survey - Insurance Component (MEPS-IC) and are presented in the aggregate and by establishment size.

About Employment-Based Health Plans
Employment-based health plans generally fall into one of two categories — fully insured plans or self-insured plans. The key distinction is whether the employer has decided to purchase an insurance contract to cover the costs and financial risks associated with its employee health plan or to use its own funds, including funds that might be set aside in a separate trust maintained by the employer (e.g., a voluntary employee beneficiary association), to cover such costs. Employers offering self-insured plans often purchase stop-loss coverage from an insurance company to mitigate the risk of higher-than-budgeted expenses. Different experts may have different views about how any particular health plan should be classified, especially when plans include a flexible spending account (FSA), health reimbursement arrangement (HRA), or health savings account (HSA) that is funded separately from the main health plan.

The fully insured/self-insured distinction is also important from a legal perspective. Under the federal Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974 (ERISA), which provides the legal framework for the uniform provision of health benefits by U.S. employers, state laws (other than insurance laws) are generally pre-empted. This means, for example, that self-insured health plans do not have to satisfy state health insurance laws, including state-mandated reserve, benefit, claims, premium, and other requirements, which results in ease of administration and lower expenses. In contrast, fully insured plans are required (among other things) to cover state-mandated benefits and pay state insurance premiums. Both fully insured and self-insured health plans may have to comply with other federal laws applicable to such plans, such as components of the Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act of 2010 (ACA).

Establishments With Self-Insured Plans
The percentage of private-sector establishments offering health plans that report they self-insure at least one of their health plans has been generally increasing since at least the mid-1990s, well before passage of the ACA. The percentage peaked in 2016, fell through 2018, and then peaked again in 2020. In 2016, 40.7 percent of private-sector establishments reported that they self-insured at least one of their health plans, up from 26.5 percent in 1999 (Figure 1). By 2018, the percentage of private-sector establishments reporting that they self-insured at least one of their health plans fell to 38.7 percent. It increased to 41.9 percent in 2020, the highest level seen during the 1996–2020 period.
There is much variation in the percentage of employers offering a self-insured plan by establishment size. Large firms are much more likely than small and medium-sized firms to self-insure at least one of their health plans. In 2020, 75.2 percent of establishments with 500 or more workers self-insured at least one plan, compared with 31.7 percent among medium-sized establishments (100–499 employees) and 16.1 percent among small establishments (fewer than 100 employees) (Figure 2).

Recent trends also differ by establishment size. Between 2013 and 2016, the portion of small establishments offering health plans reporting they self-insure at least one plan increased from 13.3 percent to 17.4 percent. It then fell to a pre-ACA rate of 13.2 percent by 2018. However, between 2018 and 2020, the rate increased to 16.1 percent.

Among medium-sized establishments, the increase in self-insurance occurred between 2013 and 2015. Since then, the percentage self-insured has been bouncing around between 29 percent and 31.7 percent.

In contrast, the share of large establishments offering self-insured options has steadily eroded until 2018, declining from 83.9 percent in 2013 to 75.9 percent in 2017. Between 2017 and 2019 it rebounded to 79.9 percent. However, in 2020, the rate dropped to 75.2 percent, the lowest level since 2013.
Workers Enrolled in Self-Insured Plans

Over the long term, along with the increase in the percentage of establishments that self-insure at least one health plan, enrollment in those plans increased as well. Between 1998 and 2015, the percentage of private-sector workers enrolled in self-insured plans increased from 40.9 percent to 60 percent (Figure 3). Enrollment in self-insured plans has since declined from this 2015 peak, bouncing around between 57.7 percent and 59.4 percent between 2016 and 2020.

Trends in enrollment in self-insured health plans are mixed when examined by firm size. There was a trend away from enrollment in self-insured health plans that started in 2016 among workers in establishments with fewer than 10 employees, 10–24 employees, and 25–99 employees. However, this reversed itself for those with fewer than 10 employees and 25–99 employees (Figure 4). Enrollment in self-insured plans among workers in establishments with 100–999 employees has been trending down since 2014 — with the exception of 2017. However, this also recently has reversed itself. In contrast to the recent small and medium-sized employer trends, enrollment in self-insured plans among workers in large establishments declined from 83 percent in 2019 to 76.9 percent in 2020.

Overall, the percentage of private-sector enrollees in self-insured plans varied from 34.8 percent in Hawaii to 72.7 percent in North Carolina (Figure 5).
Figure 3

Note: 2007 data was not collected.

Source: Various tables from the Medical Expenditure Panel Survey - Insurance Component that can be found at http://meps.ahrq.gov/mepsweb/data_stats/quick_tables.jsp

Figure 4

Source: Various tables from the Medical Expenditure Panel Survey Survey-Insurance Component that can be found at http://meps.ahrq.gov/mepsweb/data_stats/quick_tables.jsp
### Table 1: Percentage of Private-Sector Enrollees in Self-Insured Plans, by State, 2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Division and State</th>
<th>Total 100–999 Employees</th>
<th>1,000 or More Employees</th>
<th>Total 100–999 Employees</th>
<th>1,000 or More Employees</th>
<th>Total 100–999 Employees</th>
<th>1,000 or More Employees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td>57.7%</td>
<td>41.1%</td>
<td>76.9%</td>
<td></td>
<td>64.3%</td>
<td>48.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New England:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecticut</td>
<td>63.8%</td>
<td>42.3%</td>
<td>82.2%</td>
<td></td>
<td>64.2%</td>
<td>50.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maine</td>
<td>59.4%</td>
<td>29.9%</td>
<td>92.8%</td>
<td></td>
<td>73.2%</td>
<td>79.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Massachusetts</td>
<td>55.0%</td>
<td>35.4%</td>
<td>74.9%</td>
<td></td>
<td>57.2%</td>
<td>52.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Hampshire</td>
<td>56.2%</td>
<td>41.7%</td>
<td>80.3%</td>
<td></td>
<td>54.3%</td>
<td>36.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhode Island</td>
<td>66.8%</td>
<td>47.6%</td>
<td>94.0%</td>
<td></td>
<td>64.2%</td>
<td>50.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vermont</td>
<td>63.0%</td>
<td>73.6%</td>
<td>86.8%</td>
<td></td>
<td>64.2%</td>
<td>50.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle Atlantic:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Jersey</td>
<td>53.9%</td>
<td>26.5% *</td>
<td>80.4%</td>
<td></td>
<td>52.7%</td>
<td>12.8% *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td>59.1%</td>
<td>29.0%</td>
<td>82.4%</td>
<td></td>
<td>58.3%</td>
<td>31.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>60.8%</td>
<td>54.9%</td>
<td>81.0%</td>
<td></td>
<td>60.9%</td>
<td>61.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East North Central:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>59.4%</td>
<td>40.1%</td>
<td>78.8%</td>
<td></td>
<td>61.6%</td>
<td>59.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indiana</td>
<td>79.8%</td>
<td>67.2%</td>
<td>83.0%</td>
<td></td>
<td>58.3%</td>
<td>31.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michigan</td>
<td>51.4%</td>
<td>42.1%</td>
<td>69.9%</td>
<td></td>
<td>60.9%</td>
<td>61.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio</td>
<td>69.5%</td>
<td>56.4%</td>
<td>87.9%</td>
<td></td>
<td>66.6%</td>
<td>38.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wisconsin</td>
<td>56.2%</td>
<td>34.1%</td>
<td>76.5%</td>
<td></td>
<td>68.6%</td>
<td>49.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West North Central:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iowa</td>
<td>57.2%</td>
<td>57.2%</td>
<td>71.9%</td>
<td></td>
<td>64.2%</td>
<td>52.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kansas</td>
<td>60.5%</td>
<td>46.2%</td>
<td>84.9%</td>
<td></td>
<td>60.4%</td>
<td>50.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Figure does not meet standard of reliability or precision.


### Conclusion

Changes in the availability of and enrollment in self-insured health plans among various sizes of private-sector establishments that offer health plans that occurred between 2013 and 2020, after the introduction of the ACA, have ebbed and flowed, sometimes increasing, sometimes decreasing. However, the data are in large part consistent with the perspective that the ACA would cause more small employers to adopt self-insured plans. Similarly, there are questions as to whether the recent decrease in self-insurance among large firms is the start of a new trend.
Endnotes


2 Self-reported data were examined from the Medical Expenditure Panel Survey - Insurance Component (MEPS-IC), which is a survey of private- and public-sector employers fielded by the U.S. Census Bureau for the Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality (AHRQ). The survey has been fielded annually since 1996 (with the exception of 2007). Note that the survey collects data from private establishments that consist of a single physical location. It is possible that some large employers are overrepresented in the survey if more than one location was surveyed. Nearly 40,000 establishments were interviewed in 2020. See https://meps.ahrq.gov/mepsweb/survey_comp/ic_sample_size.jsp for more information.